



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 23, 2005

Ms. Sandra Gentry
Administrative Support II
City of Baytown
3200 North Main Street
Baytown, Texas 77521

OR2005-02497

Dear Ms. Gentry:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 220791.

The Baytown Police Department (the "department") received two separate requests for a specified offense report. You claim that portions of the requested information are excepted from disclosure pursuant to sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses the common law right of privacy, which excepts from disclosure information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. 540 S.W.2d at 683. In addition, this office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common law privacy: personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990); some kinds of medical information or information

indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical disabilities). We have reviewed the submitted records and agree that the information you have highlighted in yellow must be withheld under section 552.101 on the basis of common law privacy.

We note that the remaining submitted information includes social security numbers. The 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained or maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). We have no basis for concluding that the social security numbers we have marked are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I) and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Public Information Act (the "Act") imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, you should ensure that such information is not obtained or maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. We note, however, because the laws regarding the confidentiality of social security numbers are intended to protect an individual's privacy, a requestor's social security number may not be withheld from him on the basis of the federal law. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to information to person to whom information relates on grounds that information is considered confidential by privacy principles).

Section 552.108 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You inform us that the information you seek to withhold pertains to a pending criminal proceeding. Based on this representation, we agree that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information you have highlighted in orange, and it may be withheld on that basis. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases).

You also contend that other submitted information must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code. This section excepts from disclosure information that "relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state." We agree that the Texas driver's license and motor vehicle information that you have highlighted in

pink is excepted from disclosure under section 552.130. We have marked other Texas motor vehicle information that must also be withheld from the public under this exception. We note, however, that section 552.130 protects privacy interests. Accordingly, each requestor has a special right of access to his own driver's license number and information relating to a vehicle in which he owns an interest. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023. Such information may not be withheld from him under section 552.130. *See* Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself).

In summary: (1) the department must withhold the yellow-highlighted information pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy; (2) the marked social security numbers may be confidential under federal law; (3) the department may withhold the orange-highlighted information under section 552.108(a)(1); and (4) the pink-highlighted and other marked motor vehicle information must be withheld from the public under section 552.130. Each requestor has a special right of access to his own driver's license and motor vehicle information and his own social security number. The department must also release the rest of the submitted information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Debbie K. Lee
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DKL/seg

Ref: ID# 220791

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Kenneth Valeri, Jr.
1300 Olive Street
Baytown, Texas 77520
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Richard Simmons
9 East Wright Street
Baytown, Texas 77520
(w/o enclosures)